



THE CORPORATION OF THE CITY OF NIAGARA FALLS

REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL

RFP20-2019

SUPPLY & INSTALLATION OF NEW PLAYGROUND ARTIFICIAL TURF SAFETY SURFACING

APPENDIX D: EVALUATION

1. **General**

Proposals will be evaluated by City staff based upon the predetermined categories with the points weighting as set out below.

2. **Pricing Not the Most Important Factor**

The City will not necessarily accept the lowest priced of any Proposal. **Any implication that the lowest priced Proposal will be accepted is hereby expressly negated.**

3. **Selection**

The selected Proposal submission (if any) will be chosen based upon the evaluation criteria predetermined by the City which, in the City's sole decision, will determine the manner in which each Proposal submission meets the evaluation criteria stated below. The City, at its sole and unfettered decision, may seek to clarify any aspect of any Proposal submitted in response to this RFP at any time. Such clarification shall not provide any Bidder with an opportunity to improve upon or correct a previously submitted Proposal. Without limiting the generality of the foregoing, the City may elect to also negotiate with one or more Bidders at a time.

4. **Interviews and Communications with Bidders following Proposal Submission Date**

The City's evaluation team may conduct an interview with selected companies that have submitted a Proposal in response to this RFP. The City makes no commitment to hold any interviews with any Bidder and offers no rights or expectations of any kind to any company who has submitted a Proposal. If an interview is granted, it is expected to be no longer than sixty (60) minutes in length and will include an allowance for a question and answer period. The granting of an interview does not provide any Bidder with an opportunity to improve upon or correct their Proposal submission. Attempts by any Bidder to improve upon or correct a Proposal submission will result in the rejection of the said Proposal by the City.

5. **Evaluation Criteria**

The City will evaluate the Proposal submissions based upon the following weighted criteria. Bidders must respond to these criteria factors by attaching a separate page or pages for each criterion.

6. Bidder's Acknowledgment

- a) Price alone is not the only, nor necessarily the most important criteria the City will use to determine the value of services offered.
- b) The City is under no obligation whatsoever to meet with all or any Proponents who have submitted a Proposal in response to this RFP.
- c) A debriefing at the written request of a proponent shall only be conducted after the contract is executed with the selected Proponent. Under no circumstances will debriefing be held prior to the contract execution. Any proponent may request a debriefing with the Procurement Representative, with respect to their proposal submission.
- d) The City is not obligated to reveal any reasons whatsoever for its choice of a Contractor (if any) and the City is not obligated to reveal any information regarding any Proposal submitted to the City.
- e) The City reserves the right to check all references provided by the Proponent and to check additional references not stated by the Proponent. Both oral and written reference checks completed by the City will be binding on the determination of past performance by the Proponent.
- f) The City will score pricing based upon a simple mathematical formula with the lowest priced Proposal scoring the full points assigned and all other Proposals will be scored as a percentage of the lowest priced Proposal submitted.

VENDOR: _____

Criterion	Comments:	Compliant (Yes / No)
1. Safety and Accessibility		

Criterion	Maximum Points	Weight Factor	Independent Review Points x Wgt ÷ 10 = Score
2. Project Understanding and Approach	0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	10	
Comments:			
3. Project Team	0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	20	
Comments:			
4. Product Quality, Appearance and Texture	0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	40	
Comments:			
5. Warranty and Maintenance	0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	10	
Comments:			
8. Price	$S = \frac{\text{Min} \times M}{P}$ S = Score Min = Lowest Priced Proposal M = Total Points Available for Price P = Price on this Proposal	20	
Comments:			
TOTALS		100	

Instructions to Evaluator: Complete a separate evaluation form for each Proposal reviewed. Each criterion must be assigned a score unless you are instructed otherwise on the form. Make additional notes in the comments section for reference and discussion during meetings of the full evaluation panel.

The point value entered above reflects my best independent judgment of the merits of the identified bidder's Proposal.

Committee Member: _____ **Dept.:** _____
(please print)

Signature: _____ **Date:** _____

SCORING RUBRIC

Compliant	Satisfies the requirements of the criterion. Has written confirmation from regulatory body outlining compliance with industry standards.
Non-Compliant	Does not satisfy the requirements of the criterion. Will not be considered for further evaluation.

Points	Rating	Description
10	Excellent	Exceeds the requirements of the criterion in superlative beneficial ways/very desirable.
9	Very Good	Exceeds the requirements of the criterion in ways that are beneficial to the City's needs.
8	Good	Exceeds the requirements of the criterion but in a manner, which is not particularly beneficial to the City's needs
7		Fully meets all requirements of the criterion.
6	Average	Adequately meets most of the requirements of the criterion. May be lacking in some areas that are not critical.
5		Addresses most, but not all, of the requirements of the criterion to the minimum acceptable level. May be lacking in some areas that are not critical.
4	Poor	Barely meets most of the requirements of the criterion to the minimum acceptable level. May be lacking in some areas that are not critical.
3		Poor to Very Poor.
2		Minimally addresses some, but not all, of the requirements of the criterion. Lacking in critical areas.
1		Very Poor to Unsatisfactory.
0	Unsatisfactory	Does not satisfy the requirements of the criterion in any manner.

PROPONENT SUBMISSION FORMAT

Rated Criteria Category	Weighting (Points)
Safety and Accessibility	Pass/Fail
Project Understanding and Approach	10 Points
Proponent Team	20 Points
Product Quality, Appearance and Texture	40 Points
Warranty and Maintenance	10 Points
Pricing	20 Points
Total Points	100 Points

The following requirements shall be provided **in the order identified below, tabbed per item**, and in a clear and concise manner. Failure to comply with the prescribed order may result in the disqualification of the bid.

Item	Requirement	Weighting
1.0	Safety and Accessibility	Pass/Fail
1.1	Provide HIC and Gmax testing results for the proposed artificial turf system	No Page Limit
1.2	Provide information as to how the system will meet AODA accessibility requirements	Maximum 1 Page
1.3	Provide a narrative on how the selected turf system will create a safer playground environment ie: toxicity, microbial properties, temperature regulation etc.	Maximum 1 Page
1.4	Submit in writing certification from the proponent that all products and components proposed for the construction of the artificial turf systems meet all current Federal, Provincial and Municipal public health and safety requirements and comply with all current Federal, Provincial and Municipal environmental legislation and regulations. All materials proposed must be nontoxic with respect to the intended uses.	Maximum 1 Page
2.0	Project Understanding and Approach	10 Points
2.1	Proponents shall provide an understanding of the full scope of services for this project. Provide confirmation of the Proponent's skill, experience, suitability, and ability to deliver the Project within the time and budget constraints identified.	Maximum 1 Page
2.2	With specific regard to the proposed project, describe the methodology and approach for delivering the proposed project, highlighting any challenges or potential issues. Describe the investigation and design process.	Maximum 1 Page
2.3	With specific regard to the proposed project, indicate the methodologies the team will employ to obtain quality assurance and quality control in the delivery of services.	Maximum 1 Page
2.4	Provide a description of how unforeseen works will be estimated/assessed throughout the project, including how backup documentation required for Change Orders and Contemplated Change Orders will be presented to the City. Identify the means by which controls, systems and reports will be developed to verify compliance with the project plan. Describe the procedures that will be implemented to identify, monitor and assess project scope changes.	Maximum 1 Page

2.5	Provide a preliminary schedule for this project with a critical path and identify how issues and risks related to the Project schedule will be determined. The substantial completion date must be September 30th , 2019.	Maximum 2 Pages
3.0	Proponent Team	20 Points
3.1	Turf Manufacturer: Provide all details related to the manufacture of the proposed turf. Clearly identify the source, supply and the specifications related to the turf components of the proposed artificial turf system. Clearly identify the assembly and manufacturing process and the various companies involved. Provide company histories and general information.	Maximum 1 Page
3.2	Turf Installation Company: Provide company history and specific information related to artificial turf installations. Provide a minimum of ten (10) projects completed in the last five (5) years. Preference will be given to installations within the Golden Horseshoe.	Maximum 2 Pages
3.3	Turf Installation Supervisor: Provide detailed resume including installation history and qualifications for Turf Installation Supervisor proposed for the project. Turf Installation Supervisor listed is to be committed to this specific project and cannot be removed unless reviewed and approved by the Owner. Provide a minimum of ten (10) projects completed in the last five (5) years. Preference will be given to installations within the Golden Horseshoe.	Maximum 2 Pages
4.0	Product Quality, Appearance and Texture	40 Points
4.1	Provide a brief description/narrative on the redeeming qualities of the artificial turf system ie: temperature regulation, colour, feel, environmental considerations etc. Provide a letter certifying that the products that you are offering meet or exceed specified requirements. The manufacturer shall specify in writing that their turf system does not violate any other manufacturer's patents, patents allowed or patents pending.	Maximum 2 Pages
4.2	Submit one (1) 300 mm x 300 mm sample properly labelled with turf name and fiber length. Include completed technical data sheet available at the end of this section.	
4.3	Submit one (1) of primary backing complete including construction, elongation at break and percentage of shrinkage. Include completed technical data sheet available at the end of this section.	
4.4	Submit one (1) sample seam length of 300 mm –glued.	
4.5	Submit one (1) 300 mm x 300 mm sample of the shock pad including product data sheet	
4.6	Submit one (1) 300 mm x 300 mm sample of the wear mat including product data sheet.	
5.0	Warranty and Maintenance	10 Points
5.1	Provide a copy of the manufacturer's warranty illustrating conformance with the project specifications.	No Page Limit
5.2	Provide a description of what is specifically excluded from the warranty and identify and conditions that would void the warranty.	Maximum 1 Page

5.3	Provide a copy of the required maintenance procedures including frequency, specialized equipment, graffiti removal procedures etc.	No Page Limit																		
5.4	Provide three (3) illustrative examples of warranty calls that have been completed by the proponent, including response time, nature of warranty call and procedures implemented to correct the warranty issue.	Maximum 2 Pages																		
6.0	Pricing	20 Points																		
6.1	<p>Fill in the equation below to determine the price (excluding HST) to supply and install the complete artificial turf system material as per the terms of the Request for Proposal and your Proposal on <i>Appendix A: Form of Proposal</i>.</p> <p>The maximum budget is \$_____ (excluding HST). Higher points for this category may be awarded to lower prices. Failure to meet this budget may result in Proposal disqualification. Formula below will be used for scoring pricing.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="235 667 1284 816"> <tr> <td data-bbox="235 667 760 816"> $S = \frac{\text{Min} \times M}{P}$ </td> <td data-bbox="760 667 1284 816"> <p>S = Score Min = Lowest Priced Proposal M = Total Points Available for Price P = Price on this Proposal</p> </td> </tr> </table> <p>The price should represent approximately 10 installations for playground areas between 225m² to 320m². Exact requirements are to be determined following bid award. Price per unit should include, but not be limited to; material costs, fastening systems, cost of construction/installation, and required inspection fees.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="224 1018 1284 1241"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="224 1018 423 1056">Item</th> <th data-bbox="423 1018 651 1056">Unit Price</th> <th data-bbox="651 1018 906 1056">Quantity</th> <th data-bbox="906 1018 1284 1056">Total (Excluding HST)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td data-bbox="224 1056 423 1123">Turf</td> <td data-bbox="423 1056 651 1123">\$ /sq.m.</td> <td data-bbox="651 1056 906 1123">2,800 sq.m.</td> <td data-bbox="906 1056 1284 1123"></td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="224 1123 423 1190">Wear Mat</td> <td data-bbox="423 1123 651 1190">\$ each</td> <td data-bbox="651 1123 906 1190">56</td> <td data-bbox="906 1123 1284 1190"></td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="3" data-bbox="224 1190 906 1241">Grand Total</td> <td data-bbox="906 1190 1284 1241">\$ +HST</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	$S = \frac{\text{Min} \times M}{P}$	<p>S = Score Min = Lowest Priced Proposal M = Total Points Available for Price P = Price on this Proposal</p>	Item	Unit Price	Quantity	Total (Excluding HST)	Turf	\$ /sq.m.	2,800 sq.m.		Wear Mat	\$ each	56		Grand Total			\$ +HST	
$S = \frac{\text{Min} \times M}{P}$	<p>S = Score Min = Lowest Priced Proposal M = Total Points Available for Price P = Price on this Proposal</p>																			
Item	Unit Price	Quantity	Total (Excluding HST)																	
Turf	\$ /sq.m.	2,800 sq.m.																		
Wear Mat	\$ each	56																		
Grand Total			\$ +HST																	

THE FOLLOWING TECHNICAL DATA SHEET MUST BE SUBMITTED WITH BID

**CITY OF NIAGARA FALLS
Technical Data Sheet for Artificial Turf**

Technical Product Data Sheet

Provide the following technical specification information for each of the in-filled synthetic turf products to be submitted. Note that the following information will form the basis for the minimum specification levels for testing should the Owner select the product.

Product
Name: _____

Property	Minimum Spec.	Units	ASTM.
Pile yarn type			
Minimum yarn denier (Grass)			D1577
Maximum yarn denier (Grass)			D1577
Minimum yarn denier (Thatch)			D1577
Maximum yarn denier (Thatch)			D1577
Yarn breaking strength		gms./denier	D2256
Yarn melting point		degrees F	D789
Minimum pile height		inches	D418
Maximum pile height		inches	D418
Pile weight		oz./sq.yd.	D418
Primary backing weight		oz./sq.yd.	D418
Secondary backing weight		oz./sq.yd.	D418
Total weight		oz./sq.yd.	D418
No. of stitches		per inch	D418
Gauge		per inch	D418
Tuft bind		lbs.	D1335
Grab tear strength		lb.	D1682
Pill burn strength		(Pass/Fail)	D2859
Impact attenuation (max) at end of		G-max	D355
Impact attenuation (max) at end of		G-max	D355

Signature of
Manufacturer _____

***THIS FORM MUST BE COMPLETED IN FULL**

Primary Backing Manufacturer:

Full Company Name _____

Country _____

Product Trade Name _____

Product Trade Code _____

Nature of Product _____

Primary Backing:

Primary Backing Thickness (mm) _____

Weight per sq.m. in grams _____

Secondary Backing (i.e. latex) _____

Total Weight per (primary plus secondary backing in grams) _____

***THIS FORM MUST BE COMPLETED IN FULL**