



THE CORPORATION OF THE CITY OF NIAGARA FALLS

REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL

RFP11-2019

Supply and Installation of a Domed Columbarium in Maple Grove Columbarium Garden at Fairview Cemetery

APPENDIX D: EVALUATION

1. **General**

Proposals will be evaluated by City staff based upon the predetermined categories with the points weighting as set out below.

2. **Pricing Not the Most Important Factor**

The City will not necessarily accept the lowest priced of any Proposal. **Any implication that the lowest priced Proposal will be accepted is hereby expressly negated.**

3. **Selection**

The selected Proposal submission (if any) will be chosen based upon the evaluation criteria pre-determined by the City which, in the City's sole decision, will determine the manner in which each Proposal submission meets the evaluation criteria stated below. The City, at its sole and unfettered decision, may seek to clarify any aspect of any Proposal submitted in response to this RFP at any time. Such clarification shall not provide any Bidder with an opportunity to improve upon or correct a previously submitted Proposal. Without limiting the generality of the foregoing, the City may elect to also negotiate with one or more Bidders at a time.

4. **Interviews and Communications with Bidders following Proposal Submission Date**

The City's evaluation team may conduct an interview with selected companies that have submitted a Proposal in response to this RFP. The City makes no commitment to hold any interviews with any Bidder and offers no rights or expectations of any kind to any company who has submitted a Proposal. If an interview is granted, it is expected to be no longer than sixty (60) minutes in length and will include an allowance for a question and answer period. The granting of an interview does not provide any Bidder with an opportunity to improve upon or correct their Proposal submission. Attempts by any Bidder to improve upon or correct a Proposal submission will result in the rejection of the said Proposal by the City.

5. **Evaluation Criteria**

The City will evaluate the Proposal submissions based upon the following weighted criteria. Bidders must respond to these criteria factors by attaching a separate page or pages for each criterion.

**REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL – SERVICES
RFP11-2019**

**Supply and Installation of a Domed Columbarium in Maple Grove Columbarium Garden at
Fairview Cemetery**

APPENDIX D: EVALUATION

6. Bidder's Acknowledgment

- a) Price alone is not the only, nor necessarily the most important criteria the City will use to determine the value of services offered.
- b) The City is under no obligation whatsoever to meet with all or any Proponents who have submitted a Proposal in response to this RFP.
- c) A debriefing at the written request of a proponent shall only be conducted after the contract is executed with the selected Proponent. Under no circumstances will debriefing be held prior to the contract execution. Any proponent may request a debriefing with the Procurement Representative, with respect to their proposal submission.
- d) The City is not obligated to reveal any reasons whatsoever for its choice of a Contractor (if any) and the City is not obligated to reveal any information regarding any Proposal submitted to the City.
- e) The City reserves the right to check all references provided by the Proponent and to check additional references not stated by the Proponent. Both oral and written reference checks completed by the City will be binding on the determination of past performance by the Proponent.
- f) Proposals will be evaluated and scored based on the evaluation criteria.
- g) The City will score pricing based upon a simple mathematical formula with the lowest priced Proposal scoring the full points assigned and all other Proposals will be scored as a percentage of the lowest priced Proposal submitted.

**REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL – SERVICES
RFP11-2019**

**Supply and Installation of a Domed Columbarium in Maple Grove Columbarium Garden at
Fairview Cemetery**

APPENDIX D: EVALUATION

VENDOR: _____

Criterion	Maximum Points		Weight Factor	Independent Review Points x Wgt ÷ 10 = Score
1. Delivery (Completeness of RFP)	0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10		15	
2. Qualifications / Experience / References	0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10		20	
3. Timeline / Specifications & Drawings as Outlined	0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10		25	
4. Ability to Match Specifications and Design of Existing Columbarium	0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10		20	
5. Price $S = \frac{\text{Min} \times M}{P}$	S = Score Min = Lowest Priced Proposal M = Total		20	
TOTALS			100	

Instructions to Evaluator: Complete a separate evaluation form for each Proposal reviewed. Each criterion must be assigned a score unless you are instructed otherwise on the form. Make additional notes in the comments section for reference and discussion during meetings of the full evaluation panel.

The point value entered above reflects my best independent judgment of the merits of the identified bidder's Proposal.

Committee Member: _____ **Dept.:** _____
(please print)

Signature: _____ **Date:** _____

**REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL – SERVICES
RFP11-2019**

**Supply and Installation of a Domed Columbarium in Maple Grove Columbarium Garden at
Fairview Cemetery**

APPENDIX D: EVALUATION

PROPOSAL EVALUATION TABLE

RATING	DESCRIPTION
10 Excellent	Exceeds the requirements of the criterion in superlative beneficial ways/very desirable.
9 Very Good	Exceeds the requirements of the criterion in ways that are beneficial to the City's needs.
8 Good	Exceeds the requirements of the criterion but in a manner which is not particularly beneficial to the City's needs.
7	Fully meets all requirements of the criterion.
6 Average	Adequately meets most of the requirements of the criterion. May be lacking in some areas that are not critical.
5	Addresses most, but not all, of the requirements of the criterion to the minimum acceptable level. May be lacking in some areas that are not critical.
4 Poor	Barely meets most of the requirements of the criterion to the minimum acceptable level. May be lacking in some areas that are not critical.
3	Poor to Very Poor.
2	Minimally addresses some, but not all, of the requirements of the criterion. Lacking in critical areas.
1	Very Poor to Unsatisfactory.
0 Unsatisfactory	Does not satisfy the requirements of the criterion in any manner.

REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL – SERVICES
RFP11-2019

Supply and Installation of a Domed Columbarium in Maple Grove Columbarium Garden at
Fairview Cemetery

APPENDIX D: EVALUATION

PROPOSAL EVALUATION SUMMARY

Instructions to Evaluator: Complete Proposal Evaluation Summary indicating the name of each Company and their Total Score. Additional comments may be included.

COMPANY	TOTAL SCORE	COMMENTS

Committee Member: _____ **Dept.:** _____
(please print)

Signature: _____ **Date:** _____